This is a digital copy of a book that was preserved for generations on library shelves before it was carefully scanned by Google as part of a project to make the world's books discoverable online.

It has survived long enough for the copyright to expire and the book to enter the public domain. A public domain book is one that was never subject to copyright or whose legal copyright term has expired. Whether a book is in the public domain may vary country to country. Public domain books are our gateways to the past, representing a wealth of history, culture and knowledge that's often difficult to discover.

Marks, notations and other marginalia present in the original volume will appear in this file - a reminder of this book's long journey from the publisher to a library and finally to you.

Usage guidelines

Google is proud to partner with libraries to digitize public domain materials and make them widely accessible. Public domain books belong to the public and we are merely their custodians. Nevertheless, this work is expensive, so in order to keep providing this resource, we have taken steps to prevent abuse by commercial parties, including placing technical restrictions on automated querying.

We also ask that you:

+ *Make non-commercial use of the files* We designed Google Book Search for use by individuals, and we request that you use these files for personal, non-commercial purposes.
+ *Refrain from automated querying* Do not send automated queries of any sort to Google's system: If you are conducting research on machine translation, optical character recognition or other areas where access to a large amount of text is helpful, please contact us. We encourage the use of public domain materials for these purposes and may be able to help.
+ *Maintain attribution* The Google "watermark" you see on each file is essential for informing people about this project and helping them find additional materials through Google Book Search. Please do not remove it.
+ *Keep it legal* Whatever your use, remember that you are responsible for ensuring that what you are doing is legal. Do not assume that just because we believe a book is in the public domain for users in the United States, that the work is also in the public domain for users in other countries. Whether a book is still in copyright varies from country to country, and we can't offer guidance on whether any specific use of any specific book is allowed. Please do not assume that a book's appearance in Google Book Search means it can be used in any manner anywhere in the world. Copyright infringement liability can be quite severe.

About Google Book Search

Google's mission is to organize the world's information and to make it universally accessible and useful. Google Book Search helps readers discover the world's books while helping authors and publishers reach new audiences. You can search through the full text of this book on the web at `http://books.google.com/`

Compliments of H. C. Bolton

UNIV. OF MICH.
APR 22 1908

STEIN'S

"Manuel de Bibliographie Générale"

A Critical Review

BY

H. CARRINGTON BOLTON

AND

CHARLES MARTEL

[Read at a meeting of the Library Association of Washington City, held January 11, 1899, and printed in *The Publishers' Weekly* for March 11, 1899.]

NEW YORK

Reprinted from "The Publishers' Weekly"

1899

Digitized by Google

Digitized by Google

STEIN'S "MANUEL DE BIBLIOGRAPHIE GÉNERALE."

M. FUNCK-BRENTANO, in an article on the "Problems of Bibliography" published in the *Revue des Deux Mondes*, for January 1, 1898, names three events that marked the year 1897 as epoch-making in bibliographical science, one of which was the appearance of a "Manuel de Bibliographie Générale," by Henri Stein. This handbook forms an attractive volume of nearly 900 pages, of convenient size, clear typography, and excellent paper. The author says in the preface that the book comprises a synthesis of all the bibliographies published to the end of 1896, and constitutes a new "Bibliotheca Bibliographica" analogous to the volume of this name issued at Leipzig in 1866 by Dr. Julius Petzholdt. He commends this monumental work, and admits his indebtedness to it, but adopts his method of classification in part only, modifying it to suit recent views. Incidentally Mr. Stein pays his respects to Leon Vallée's "Bibliographie des Bibliographies," (Paris 1884 and 1887,) and refers to the incompetence of that gentleman notwithstanding his position as a librarian of the Bibliothèque Nationale.

Stein divides his subject into seventeen main sections, the names of which need not be here repeated; each of these is subdivided into eight to fourteen minor sections, and these are again split up into many special categories; as he himself remarks "the division is sometimes continued to infinity, in order to render the classification clear and the research as convenient as possible."

Titles of periodicals are uniformly printed in italics, an excellent feature, which might have been applied with equal advantage to the subject index at the end to distinguish the main reference. To the majority of titles brief annotations are affixed, generally pointing out characteristics of excellence, or books to be shunned; works neither remarkable nor "detestable" being passed without comment. Stein claims to have seen most of the works cited and to have written the appreciations only in the interest of science; they deserve confidence as a rule, for we have noted but rare instances where they invite dissent, or seem at variance with the judgment of specialists.

The work does not pretend to displace but rather to continue that of Petzholdt, and contains only a selection not arbitrarily made; general treatises when complete dispense with the use of minor special ones. The author admits the difficulties that arise in classifying books by subjects and expresses the hope that he has succeeded in placing each title in the section in which it is most likely to be sought.

The volume contains three large Appendixes:

I. Typographical Geography.

II. List of Indexes to Periodicals.

III. List of Catalogues issued by Libraries.

Considering the magnitude of the work, on which the author spent ten years, his preface is exceedingly modest, and this should be borne in mind in undertaking to criticise the volume.

The work of a bibliographer requires a wide range of learning, infinite attention to minute details, industry and perseverance; the result of his arduous labor is appreciated by a very small number, and the recompense is usually represented by zero; under these conditions the appearance of any bibliography should be greeted with words of praise for the author's endeavor to place in the hands of students means for getting at special knowledge, and the smallest adverse criticism must seem ungracious in the extreme. Nevertheless, commendation for industry is not incompatible with criticism of the result of that industry, a fact that must be recognized by the reviewer of books.

With Stein's "Manuel" before us we propose to examine it on three points:

I. Are the titles well selected?

II. Are they accurately given?

III. Is the material arranged so as to be handy for reference?

A cursory glance at the volume reveals the fact that it contains no author-index, and this astounding omission renders a study of its contents difficult from the very outset. This serious blemish will require further comment later on.

Turning now to the opening pages, the omission of a division Bibliographies of bibliography is inexplicable. The reference in the preface to Petzholdt, Vallée, Ottino and Fumagalli, and Bergmans, suffices in no way. They should have been cited at the beginning of the work in a special rubric, or in a list of sources (if not in the body of the book in their proper class,) together with some others of lesser importance, which may yet be consulted with profit, even though the material has presumably been incorporated to a large extent in the "Manuel." Such are G. Pawlowski's "Travaux bibliographiques," 1867–78, (in Congrès bibliographique international, Compte-rendu, Paris, 1879, also separately issued;) Stein's own report (1879–88) to the Congrès bibliographique international tenu à Paris, 1888, (Compte rendu, Paris, 1889;) the article "Bibliographie," by Daniel Grand, in the "Grande encyclopédie" t. 6.; the Boston Public Library Handbook for readers. 9th ed., 1890; the full monthly lists since 1884 in the *Centralblatt für Bibliothekswesen*, and other bibliographical periodicals, especially the *Revue internationale des archives, des bibliothèques et des musées*, 1895–96, and its successor, *Le Bibliographe moderne*, edited by M. Stein himself.

Section I. comprises "Universal Bibliographies," and the first subsection bears the heading "Generalities"; in this division are only five titles. Swan Sonnenschein is cited inexactly, and the compiler's intentions with reference to the two volumes are misunderstood.

The second subdivision is "Encyclopædias," in which numerous errors occur, though the works cited are accessible to every one. Ersch and Gruber is named, but no explanation is given of the issue of this work in sections, nor of its incomplete state; the edition of Meyer's "Konversations Lexikon" cited is not the latest; and to Brockhaus' "Konversations-

142114

Digitized by Google

Lexikon" a wrong number of volumes is given. A notable omission in this subdivision is the great French encyclopædia of Larousse.

The third minor subdivision is styled "Rare Books," and the fourth "Ancient works and Incunabula," Harrisse's "Excerpta Colombiniana" being rather out of place here; no mention is vouchsafed of the admirable work by Mlle. Marie Pellechet, "Catalogue général des Incunables des Bibliothèques publiques de France," v. 1 of which appeared in May, 1897. Inasmuch as the Manuel actually appeared in July, 1898, and many books of 1897 are cited (*e.g.*, p. 87, G. Gavet's "Manuel de bibliographie juridique," which is not yet published) this omission seems unaccountable.

The next subdivision is "Great Catalogues of Libraries," alphabetically arranged by countries, only six being represented, and the United States being credited with only one work.

Section II. is devoted to National Bibliographies arranged by countries in alphabetical order. Under Germany we find the well-known works of Heinsius, and of Kayser; then, one of the series by Hinrichs is incorrectly cited (viz., the "Fünf-Jahrs-Katalog,") and a note states that the other bibliographical serials issued by that publisher will be noted elsewhere. On the next page he cites the "Allgemeine Bibliographie" and its successor, the "Wöchentliches Verzeichniss," but in no place that we can find, (and the absence of an Author-Index makes the search difficult,) does Stein explain the difference and merits of other serial publications by Hinrichs. Fock's "Bibliog. Monatsbericht über Schul- und Universitätschriften" follows here, and a reference at least would have been in place to p. 285: Bibliographies académiques, and to p. 287: Thèses et discours, subdivisions under "Philologie."

The classification, well conceived and practical in general, lacks here and there uniformity in design; sometimes a heading is devised for a single book, and the subdivisions are frequently so minute as to render it quite difficult to find a given book.

Many singular instances of peculiar classification of individual books occur. In the subsection "Chemistry, Generalities," we find Eiloart's (name misspelled) "Bibliography of Stereo-chemistry," a work on ptomaines, and one on bacteriology, topics hardly falling under generalities. Platzmann's "Verzeichniss einer Auswahl amerikanischer Grammatiken, Wörterbücher, Katechismen u. s. w." Leipzig, 1876, appears under Catechisms, section of Practical Theology, and is not mentioned at p. 261–62: Philologie—Amérique, though it is a list of grammars, dictionaries, etc., of Indian languages. The *Quarterly Journal of Economics* appears under "Finances"; it should be placed at p. 115, (Sciences économ. et sociales : Généralités.) Macdonald's "Abnormal Man" is found under Anthropology; it had been better placed under "Criminal Law" (Sociology) pp. 109–110,) since there is no section devoted to "Criminal Anthropology" which might have been introduced to advantage. Classification is, however, so much a question of taste and personal bias that the criticism of this character would have little weight, provided Stein had furnished readers with an Author Index, the absence of which necessitates looking for a given work in the section in which the user imagines it might be found. Gallardo's "Ensayo de una bibliotheca de libros raros," for example, appears at page 18 under "National Bibliographies," whereas it would be naturally sought for at p. 266 under "Philologie et Belles Lettres," subdivision "Spain." Books relating to Slavery are placed under Socialism. Bahder's "Deutsche Philologie in Grundriss" is hidden away at p. 258 (Dialects,) it certainly belongs at p. 254 (Philology—Germany.) Varnhagen (p. 288) is out of place with general lists of theses, or should at least be cited at p. 251 and p. 254. At p. 65 "Livres condamnés par le pouvoir spirituel," a reference is due to p. 309 "Livres condamnés par le pouvoir temporel," especially as the latter division is not indexed under "Prohibés (livres,)" while the former is; p. 112 after the division "Propriété littéraire" would have been a more suitable place. Ophthalmology, Otology, and Dentistry are subsections of "Médecine interne." Gynæcology and obstetrics likewise are found or rather lost there under the heading Maladies génito-urinaires. Huber, J. C. "Bibliog. d. klin. Helminthologie" appears in company with "albuminurie" and venereal diseases under the heading "Maladies du sang" (!) The section "Chirurgie générale" contains three general works, one on plastic surgery, one on hernia, two on orthopædia, one on massage, two on electrotherapy, the latter three surely better in the next following division, "Thérapeutique." The *Zeitschrift f. Psychologie und Physiologie der Sinnesorgane* (p. 223) should be referred to at p. 172 (Anatomie et Physiologie) as well.

The errors in transcribing titles are unfortunately quite numerous, and we select a few of the most glaring. Swan Sonnenschein and Hinrichs have been mentioned: on page 7 *Bulletino* for *Bollettino*; at p. 8 Brockhaus' *Allgemeine Bibliographie* is said to have disappeared with Petzholdt's *Neuer Anzeiger*, whereas the *Allgemeine* is published regularly (now in its 44th year;) similarly the *Cesky Katalog* (p. 15,) supposed to have lapsed after the first year (1889,) appears regularly; on p. 19 the "American Catalogue" is credited to Kelly down to 1892. Leypoldt and Bowker are not mentioned; p. 22 J. Le Soudier for H. Le Soudier; p. 25, Papadopouto-Vreto for Papadopoulos-Vretos; p. 27 (Szabo) 1884–85 should be 1879–85; p. 32, Garcia, the Mexican author, appears under Icazbalceta, J. G.; p. 36, I. A. for I. F. da Silva; disfigured German titles are frequent, *e.g.*, p. 66 (Reusch); p. 76 (Zunz), ibid. (Hartmann); p. 77 (Brambach); p. 96 (Stintzing); p. 121 (André); p. 166 (Monticelli); p. 168 (Fauna.) At p. 161 (Albee) read [Harvard University Library. Bibliograph. contribut. No. 51;] pp. 166 and 167, the Bulletin of the Museum of Comparative Zoölogy is cited, but place of publication is omitted; Dr. Billings' monumental Index-Catalogue is given as having 8 volumes instead of 16, though v. 16 is mentioned in the note, where it is said to contain the "Periodical list," which in fact is in v. 10. Ernst Kuhn, whose name is a household word in oriental philology, is persistently cited as Kühn wherever his name appears (p. 240, 241, 242;) similarly, p. 264, Schnürrer for Schnurrer; p. 499, Würzbach for Wurzbach.

At p. 88 [Schulz] read 1882–90 for 1891; p. 159, "[P. Mayer] *Zoologischer Jahresbericht.* Leipzig, 1879 et ss," is entirely inadequate: The *Jahresbericht* is edited by the "Zoologische Station zu Neapel," which deserves to be mentioned; it was at first "redigirt" (1879–80) by

Digitized by Google

J. V. Carus, 1881 by Carus und R. Mayer, 1882 by Carus, Mayer and W. Giesbrecht, 1883–85 by Mayer and Giesbrecht, 1886 & ff. by Mayer; moreover it is published since 1885–6 not by Engelmann in Leipzig, but at Berlin by Friedländer. The Bibliographia zoologica mentioned next is a publication of the Concilium bibliographicum, of which nothing is said. Similarly no reference is made to the Zoologische Station zu Neapel which edits the "Fauna und Flora des Golfs von Neapel" (p. 168.) P. 169 Semper, C. "Reisen im Archipel der Philippinen." Wiesbaden "1868–85 4 v." is still in progress and had long exceeded 4 v. even in 1885. The Bibliotheca diabolica (p. 192) is by H. Kernot. The Bibliotheca belgica (p. 272) is still in progress and contains not 27 v. 1880–90, but circa 142 fasc. 1880–98. P. 225 (Senator) read albuminurie for albuminuerie; p. 290 (Delepierre) read Macaronéana; p. 299 (Molins. Note) read Juan Corominas for L. Coromiles, and artistas for artistns; p. 341 (Foster) the blunder Gherokees for Cherokees has been preserved in the index, no reference being found under Cherokees; p. 240 (Copinger) read 1500 for 1550; p. 530 Tompkins for Tomkins, and 1888 for 1887.

Carelessness in proof-reading will account for some of the singular blunders which are not uncommon; "The Royal Commission on strikles" (p. 126) has a queer look; and "Verzeichniss deutscher sexueller und cosmetischer Sexuellen" when "Schriften" is intended, ought to have been detected. We note "Raktische" for "praktische" (p. 692); the use of the capital I in the place of J in the word Jahrbuch is not in good taste; and Irvin-gianer quite disguises the word by erroneous division at the end of a line (p. 529); "bibliphical" for "bibliographical" (p. 137); XIX. Century where "XVI." is correct and of importance (p. 138); the omission of the word "results" in the title of Carr's "Synopsis of elementary [results] in pure mathematics" (p. 144), which work, moreover, is given as published in Boston instead of London; "Neibreich" for Neilreich (p. 156); "New York State diary Commissioner" for Dairy (p. 152).

We now turn to a section devoted to a subject in which one of us happens to be at home—Chemistry, and we note the following: No attempt at a complete treatment of the subject is made because the Select Bibliography of Chemistry published by the Smithsonian Institution makes details superfluous (see p. xviii). Under "Generalities" two French Dictionaries are cited (none in English or German) and a half a dozen indexes to special classes of literature; this is followed by a section devoted to "Current Literature" (p. 149,) in which seven periodicals are catalogued, three of which are erroneously given, viz.: the well-known *Jahresbericht der Chemie* is given as edited by Fittica, not one word being said about Liebig and Wöhler, its renowned founders, and it is said to have been established in 1861, a date that should be 1847. Besides, Fittica did not become editor until 1875.

The *Journal of Analytical and Applied Chemistry* has its title misspelled and is said to be current, whereas it was merged into *J. Amer. Chem. Soc.* in 1894. The *Jahresbericht über die Fortschritte der Agricultur-Chemie*, established by Hoffmann in 1858, is stated to have been begun in 1878. These important errors need not have been made had the author consulted the Bibliography published by the Smithsonian Institution, which, moreover, is commended by him.

On p. 151 G. J. Rockwell's "Index to the Literature of Vanadium" is ascribed to "C. Rockwood," and unhappily placed in the same paragraph with an entirely different work by A. R. Leeds.

Under Electricity in the adjoining section, Webb's "Index to the Literature of Electrolysis" is correctly cited, but the French translation of the same by Donato Tommasi is not named.

In the analysis of the contents of Fremy's voluminous "Encyclopédie chimique" the element "Sodium" is misprinted "Sidium," and this new creation is carefully preserved in the index of subjects with which the work closes.

Not a single history of chemistry is mentioned, though space might have been given to the six magnificent quarto volumes edited in 1887–1893 by Berthelot, the eminent French chemist.

The author of this Manual of Bibliography expressly states that the selection of titles is not arbitrarily made, and he hopes that no important work has escaped his notice. To criticise a list of books by pointing out the omissions only, is a most uncharitable procedure, and we therefore assert that the thanks of librarians and students are due to M. Stein for the titles included (so far as correctly given;) nevertheless it is permissible to indicate a few omissions.

And first we note the absence of cross-references, which are always so important in any classified list of books; a few notes occur, but no attempt has been made to introduce cross-references systematically. Another class of omissions is that of the number of volumes of periodicals.

A few books missed in a hasty examination are here given: p. 4 Dauze. *Revue biblio-iconographique* 1892–3 & ff.; ibid., (p. 20) Publishers' trade list annual; "American Book prices current" v. 1; 1895 & ff; (p. 23) Jordell. "Catalogue annuel de la librairie française," Paris 1893 & ff.; (p. 32) Medina, J. T. "La imprenta en Mexico" (1539–1810) Sevilla, 1893; p. 72 (resp. 772) the most important of Smith's Quaker bibliographies, the "Descriptive catalogue of Friends' books." 1867, 2 v. and Supplement. 1893; p. 125 (or 439) Hoe, R. "Literature of printing." London, 1877; p. 137 (resp. 775) Poggendorff; v. 3: 1858–83. 1896; p. 131 Rethwisch, C. *Jahresberichte üb. d. höhere Schulwesen;* ibid. Kehrbach, K. "Das gesammte Erziehungs- und Unterrichtswesen." Juni, 1896 & ff.; p. 136 Rockwell, J. E. "Teaching, practice and literature of Shorthand." Wash. 1884 (U. S. Bureau of Education. Circular of information 1884, No. 2;) p. 139 The "Ukazatel russkoi literatury" 1876 ff. Kiev, 1877, ff., ed. for the "Kievskoi Obshchestvo Estestvoispytatelei" by N. A. Bunge; p. 147 "Deutsche Seewarte zu Hamburg. Katalog der Bibliothek." Hamburg, 1890; p. 169 *Zeitschrift für Ethnologie;* p. 238 Jöcher-Rothermund 7. Bd. 1897; Catalogues of private libraries when of superior bibliographical value should have been included, *e.g.* p. 267 Salva y Mallen, P. Catálogo, 1872, 2 v.; Heredia, R. Catalogue (Collection Salvà) Paris, 1891–94. 4 v.; Boston Public Library. Catalogue of the Spanish library of G. Ticknor. Boston, 1879;

Digitized by Google

at p. 266–70 we miss Émile Picot's "Catalogue de la bibliothèque de feu M. le baron de Rothschild." 4 v. 1885–98; and Lintilhac's "Précis historique." 1894–5. 2 v., bibliographically much more important than Lanson's "Histoire" p. 263 *Zeitschrift für deutsche Philologie; Zeitschrift für deutsches Alterthum und deutsche Litteratur;* and more particularly Pfeiffer's *Germania* with its very valuable bibliography (1862 & ff.;) p. 264 *Anglia* with special bibliographical supplement current and annual 1877 & ff.; also Körtings "Grundriss d. Gesch. d. engl. Literatur" 2e Aufl. 1893; Hazlitt's "Handbook" 1867, and Collections and notes; 3 series and suppl. 1876–89; p. 271 the *Giornale storico della letteratura italiana;* ibid., Mazzoni. "Avviamento allo studio critico delle lettere italiane." 1892; p. 275–78 *Mélusine;* and *Zeitschrift d. Vereins für Volkskunde;* p. 294 the 4th ed. of Brümmer; and Kürschner's *Litteratur-Kalender;* p. 285 the Ergänzungsheft 1892, zu Kukula; p. 291 Wulp, J. K. "Catalogus van de tractaten (etc.) in de bibiotheek van I. Meulman 1866–68, 3 v., very important and intended as "2e afdeelg." of Muller's "Bibliotheek"; p. 435 the *Library Journal;* and the *Monthly notes of the L. A. U. K.;* the *Library chronicle;* the *Library;* the *Revue des bibliothèques;* the *Rivista delle biblioteche; Bulletin du bibliophile; Courier du livre* (Québec.)

The Appendixes are useful for their purposes, but not free from blemishes, nor is a list of general indexes to periodicals "pour la première fois tenté ici" (cf. Boston Public Library. Handb. f. readers 9th ed. 1890 p. 265–311.) The index volume is lacking of *Neue Zeitschrift für Rübenzucker Industrie* (1894) and that of the *Zeitschrift für wissenschaftliche Zoologie* is erroneously given; Vols. I–XXX, 1876, should be I–XV (1868,) and XVI–XXX, (1879.) The dates of the Index volume of the *Journal de pharmacie d'Anvers* are wholly incorrect: "I–X (1855–64) 1865" should be I–X (1845–54) 1855, or ten years earlier throughout.

Once more we must express our great dissatisfaction at the absence of the Author-Index; we had been unable to find under any category the important "Bibliotheca Bibliographica Italica" of Ottino and Fumagalli, although it is mentioned in the preface, until we discovered it later quite accidentally at p. 436.

M. Stein says in his preface: "the mission of a bibliographer is quite different from that ordinarily thought; a maker of catalogues is no more a bibliographer than a manufacturer of seltzer water is a chemist, or an accountant is a mathematician." This may have much of truth; nevertheless, we maintain that a bibliographer should be a good cataloguer, and M. Stein cannot lay claim to the subordinate title. He sometimes falls into the gross error of giving as the title of a book the name by which it is called colloquially; a notable instance is the way in which he gives to the reader of his manual the title of a prominent catalogue; he writes it thus: "General Catalogue of the British Museum Library, London 1881 et ss. 8vo." whereas it should read: "British Museum. Catalogue of Printed Books, London, 1881, et ss. 4to." In Stein's Manual neither the title nor size are correct. Similarly the "Accessions" catalogue quoted under an inaccurate title is said to be "annual," whereas since 1880 over 450 parts have appeared.

In conclusion: this review is the result of a mere superficial examination of the Manual; we have jotted down only what the eye and the memory detected in casual use of the volume, with scarcely any attempt at comparison with other treatises. To the reader and reference librarian the defects noted will seldom prove a serious hindrance, but bibliographers and cataloguers demanding accurate and full reference may use the "Manuel" only with the greatest caution, and never without verifying the titles whenever it is in their power to do so. There is no other single book where such a wealth of bibliographical information may be found; it is the more to be regretted that the very competent and able compiler has permitted a little apparent haste and carelessness to detract much from the otherwise almost inestimable value of the Bibliotheca bibliographica nova.

Digitized by Google

Digitized by Google

Digitized by Google

Digitized by Google

Digitized by Google